Provided for non-commercial research and education use. Not for reproduction, distribution or commercial use.



This article appeared in a journal published by Elsevier. The attached copy is furnished to the author for internal non-commercial research and education use, including for instruction at the authors institution and sharing with colleagues.

Other uses, including reproduction and distribution, or selling or licensing copies, or posting to personal, institutional or third party websites are prohibited.

In most cases authors are permitted to post their version of the article (e.g. in Word or Tex form) to their personal website or institutional repository. Authors requiring further information regarding Elsevier's archiving and manuscript policies are encouraged to visit:

http://www.elsevier.com/copyright

General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



General and Comparative Endocrinology



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/ygcen

Higher thyroid hormone receptor expression correlates with short larval periods in spadefoot toads and increases metamorphic rate

Amy R. Hollar, Jinyoung Choi, Adam T. Grimm, Daniel R. Buchholz*

Department of Biological Sciences, University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, OH 45221, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 17 December 2010 Revised 2 May 2011 Accepted 19 May 2011 Available online 30 May 2011

Keywords: Spadefoot toad Metamorphosis Thyroid hormone receptor Evolution

ABSTRACT

Spadefoot toad species display extreme variation in larval period duration, due in part to evolution of thyroid hormone (TH) physiology. Specifically, desert species with short larval periods have higher tail tissue content of TH and exhibit increased responsiveness to TH. To address the molecular basis of larval period differences, we examined TH receptor (TR) expression across species. Based on the dual function model for the role of TR in development, we hypothesized that desert spadefoot species with short larval periods would have (1) late onset of TR expression prior to the production of endogenous TH and (2) higher TR levels when endogenous TH becomes available. To test these hypotheses, we cloned fragments of TR α and TRB genes from the desert spadefoot toads Scaphiopus couchii and Spea multiplicata and their non-desert relative Pelobates cultripes and measured their mRNA levels in tails using quantitative PCR in the absence (premetamorphosis) or presence (natural metamorphosis) of TH. All species express TR α and TR β from the earliest stages measured (from just after hatching), but S. couchii, which has the shortest larval period, had more TR α throughout development compared to *P. cultripes*, which has the longest larval period. TR β mRNA levels were similar across species. Exogenous T3 treatment induced faster TH-response gene expression kinetics in S. couchii compared to the other species, consistent with its higher TRa mRNA expression and indicative of a functional consequence of more $TR\alpha$ activity at the molecular level. To directly test whether higher TRa expression may contribute to shorter larval periods, we overexpressed TRa via plasmid injection into tail muscle cells of the model frog Xenopus laevis and found an increased rate of muscle cell death in response to TH. These results suggest that increased TRa expression evolved in S. couchii and contribute to its higher metamorphic rates.

© 2011 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Spadefoot toads are a closely related group of anurans that display extreme variation in larval period duration [4,17]. The group exhibits the shortest to some of the longest known larval periods among amphibians [14,27]. New World spadefoot toad genera (*Scaphiopus* and *Spea*) live mostly in xeric environments while Old World spadefoot toads (*Pelobates*) live in mediterranean climates or temperate forests [25,43]. Even though interspecies variation in larval period can be partially attributed to the effects of the dramatically different environments [28], New World taxa exhibit intrinsically shorter larval periods compared to Old World taxa when reared under identical laboratory conditions [4]. Specifically, *Scaphiopus* had the shortest larval period of all three genera, *Spea* is intermediate, and *Pelobates* has the longest (16 vs. 24 vs. 35 days, respectively).

Because thyroid hormone (TH) controls metamorphosis in amphibians [12,38], TH physiology is likely central to the

* Corresponding author. Fax: +1 513 556 5299.

E-mail address: buchhodr@ucmail.uc.edu (D.R. Buchholz).

explanation for how the extremely short larval periods evolved in New World spadefoot toads [7]. The simplest explanation for accelerated metamorphosis in desert species would be increased levels of circulating TH or earlier production of TH via changes in the hypothalamic-pituitary-thyroid (HPT) axis. Indeed, it has been shown in spadefoot toads that desert species with shorter larval periods have higher TH-tissue content in the tail during metamorphosis compared to non-desert species [5]. However, because of cellular factors influencing TH signaling (see below), these results may not reflect plasma levels and thus cannot distinguish between central and peripheral control as the site of evolutionary change underlying larval period differences. Stronger evidence, from *in vitro* tail tip assays. exists for altered peripheral control as a mechanism for achieving shorter larval periods [5]. Tail tips from three spadefoot species shrank at rates correlating with their varied larval period durations when exposed to the same concentrations of TH, indicating species differences in TH responsivity. These in vitro results indicate that evolution of peripheral control mechanisms contributed to increased rates of metamorphic change.

Peripheral control of metamorphic tissue transformation is achieved through the combinatorial effects of cellular factors influencing TH signaling [40]. For tissues to respond to the TH

^{0016-6480/\$ -} see front matter \circledcirc 2011 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/j.ygcen.2011.05.013

A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

signal, TH (typically the inactive version T4) must first enter the cell via TH-transporters [22,46]. Once inside the cell, deiodinase enzymes can either activate T4 to make the active form T3 or inactivate T4 and T3 [1,18]. T4 and T3 bind cytoplasmic TH-binding proteins, which may reduce the levels of free TH within the cell [39]. Finally, T3 must bind to TRs in the nucleus to exert its effects [41]. TRs function as transcription factors by binding to TH-response elements (TREs) of DNA sequences as heterodimers with retinoid X receptors (RXRs) [47]. This heterodimer complex alters gene expression through the recruitment of cofactors, initiating the gene cascade events that lead to the morphological changes associated with metamorphosis [7]. Evolutionary changes in the expression levels of any of these TH-signaling proteins could potentially alter the amount of TH signaling, thereby giving rise to altered rates of tissue transformation and larval period duration [2].

As TRs are central to TH signaling and metamorphosis [9], altered TR expression among species was a prime candidate for an evolutionary change that could explain the faster tail shrinkage and by extension the shorter larval period duration in *Scaphiopus couchii*. Frogs, like all vertebrates, have two TR genes, TR α and TR β [49]. These TR genes have very different temporal expression profiles, where TR α expression begins shortly after hatching and increases in tissues as they remodel. TR β expression is low throughout premetamorphosis and has some embryonic effects [20] but becomes strongly upregulated during tissue transformation in response to the presence of TH [48]. The difference in THinducibility between TR α and TR β is due to the presence of a TRE in the TR β promoter [34]. Both TRs are believed to have overlapping molecular roles in transcription, though some differences have been detected [11].

The dual function model for the role of TR in development provides a framework for understanding how evolutionary changes in the expression of TR may influence the timing and rate of metamorphosis [7]. In the absence of TH, TRs function to repress expression of TH-response genes, while in the presence of TH they activate transcription of these same genes. This dual function is based on the interaction of TRs with different types of cofactors. Before endogenous TH levels rise, unliganded TRs are bound to corepressors, such as N-CoR (nuclear receptor corepressors) and SMRT (silencing mediator for retinoid and thyroid hormone receptors), and this complex inhibits the transcription of TH-response genes [35,45]. Once endogenous TH levels begin to increase, the binding of T3 leads to a conformational change in TR, resulting in an affinity for the binding of coactivators such as SRC (steroid receptor coactivator) 1, 2, and 3, and inhibiting the binding of corepressors. Coactivators then acetylate and methylate histones, which promotes transcription of TH-response genes [21,26,30-32].

To examine the potential role of TRs in the evolution of accelerated metamorphosis, we cloned partial gene sequences of $TR\alpha$ and TR_β from S. couchii, Spea multiplicata, and Pelobates cultripes and compared their mRNA expression in whole bodies during early development and in tails during metamorphic development in each species. Because endogenous TH is undetectable during premetamorphic development [5], TRs are expected to function as repressors of metamorphic genes. If a species had a delay in detectable TRs during this time, they would potentially have less repression of metamorphic genes, which could lead to a faster onset of metamorphosis, as seen in experiments in Xenopus [37]. Thus, we hypothesized that TRs will first become detectable at later developmental stages in species with shorter larval periods. Because TH-response gene expression levels depends on TR expression levels and the induced rate of metamorphosis depends on exogenous hormone concentration [8,38], more TRs during metamorphosis would enable a faster or higher change in

expression of metamorphic genes, and ultimately lead to a shorter larval period. Thus, we also hypothesized that species with shorter larval periods will have greater TR expression levels during natural metamorphosis when TH is present.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Animal care and treatment

Adult S. couchii and S. multiplicata were collected from southeastern Arizona and southwestern New Mexico during the summer of 2007. Spawn (a mixture of six clutches) and adult P. cultripes were collected from Doñana National Park, Spain in November 2007 and shipped to the University of Cincinnati. Adult spadefoot toads were maintained in approximately 15-20 cm soil in large plastic tanks with screened lids, fed ad libidum crickets dusted with vitamins (Nekton-Rep-Color) and sprinkled with water as needed. Induction of breeding to obtain tadpoles was described previously [4]. Tadpoles were reared in aerated 400 liter stock tanks at 28 °C with a 12L/12D cycle, and were fed ad libidum ground rabbit chow twice daily. Water was changed as needed. Tadpoles of Xenopus laevis were bred from laboratory stock and reared to NF stage 56 [29]. The care and treatment of the animals used in this study were in accordance with the protocols approved by the University of Cincinnati Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee.

2.2. Tissue collection

Tadpoles were removed from stock tanks at predetermined developmental stages and anesthetized in benzocaine prior to tissue collection. For early stages (Gosner 23–28) [19], whole tadpoles were snap frozen on dry ice, and samples were pooled to ensure sufficient material for RNA isolation. For later stages (Gosner 32, 35, 38, 42, 44), tadpoles were first anesthetized in benzocaine, then tails were excised and snap frozen on dry ice. Some *S. couchii* and *S. multiplicata* tail samples were pooled due to their small size (no *P. cultripes* tails were pooled).

Two T3 doses were used with Gosner 31 tadpoles: 8 nM (a minimum dose to induce a response across spadefoot toad genera in a tail tip assay [5] and 50 nM (a potentially saturating dose based on studies done in Xenopus), as well as untreated tadpoles. T3 was dissolved in 0.5 N NaOH as a 1 mM stock with a final concentration of 2.5×10^{-5} – 4×10^{-6} N NaOH in the rearing water depending on T3 dose. Because tadpoles vary greatly in size, we adjusted the water volume for the T3 treatments based on the average tadpole body mass of the species at stage 31 [4] to ensure that the same amount of TH per gram body mass was available across species. Thus, S. couchii tadpoles were kept at a density of five tadpoles per tank in 1 L of water, S. multiplicata tadpoles were kept at a density of one tadpole per tank in 1 L of water, and P. cultripes tadpoles were kept at a density of one tadpole per tank in 4 L of water. Water and hormone were changed daily. Tadpoles were not fed during T3 treatment. Tails were harvested as described above at 0, 12, 24, 48, 72, 120, and 168 h post-T3 induction. Control tadpoles were harvested at 0, 72, and 120 h, and no significant differences were found among time points in the control animals for each species (data not shown). Species varied in their ability to survive exposure to T3 levels, and within a given treatment and species all individuals died within 24 h of each other. S. couchii tadpoles died between 48 and 72 h of 50 nM T3 exposure and between 72 and 96 h of 8 nM T3 exposure. S. multiplicata tadpoles died between 48 and 72 h of 50 nM T3 exposure and between 120 and 144 h of 8 nM T3 exposure. P. cultripes tadpoles died between 72 and 96 h of 50 nM T3 exposure and between 168 and 192 h of 8 nM T3 exposure. Due to their small size, five S. couchii tails were pooled to A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

make one sample. No *S. multiplicata* or *P. cultripes* samples were pooled. All samples were stored at -80 °C.

2.3. RNA isolation and cDNA synthesis

Total RNA was extracted from frozen samples using Trizol reagent following the manufacturer's protocol (Invitrogen). Sample homogenization was done using a Fisher Scientific Power Gen 125 for up to 1 min per sample. RNA was resuspended using RNase-free water and stored at -80 °C. RNA concentrations were measured using a Nanodrop ND-1000 Spectrophotometer. cDNA was synthesized using 2 µg of total RNA using the High Capacity cDNA Reverse Transcription Kit following the manufacturer's protocol (Applied Biosystems). Two microliters of neat or 10-fold diluted cDNA were used in quantitative PCR for TRs and rpL8, respectively.

2.4. Cloning spadefoot TR α , TR β , and rpL8

Three micrograms total RNA from S. multiplicata Gosner stage 44 tail, S. couchii Gosner stage 42 tail and whole body, and P. cultripes Gosner stage 42 head isolated using TriZol (Invitrogen) was used to make cDNA as above. One microliter of cDNA per 20 µL reaction or 2 µL per 50 µL reaction was used to PCR amplify fragments of TR α , TR β , and rpL8 using high fidelity Taq polymerase (PrimeSTAR HS DNA polymerase, Takara) with the listed primers and PCR conditions (Tables 1A and 1B). Final primer concentration was $0.5 \,\mu\text{M}$ and there were 35 cycles for each reaction. DRB20b/ 21b were previously designed for Xenopus rpL8 [6]. DRB182 and DRB185 were designed to amplify TRs from Lepidobatrachus (C. Infante, unpublished). DRB203, 206, 207, 208 are degenerate primers designed by hand using alignments of TR α , TR β , or rpL8 sequences from X. laevis, Spea hammondii, and sequenced human, mouse, chick, and zebrafish genomes. PCR products were gel purified (Qia-Quick Gel Extraction Kit, Qiagen) and sequenced in both directions with the same primers used for PCR amplification. PCR products from three to four individuals per gene per species were sequenced.

2.5. Quantitative PCR

Quantitative PCR (qPCR) with Taqman FAM-labeled probes was carried out to quantitate expression levels of TR α , TR β , and the housekeeping gene rpL8 in single-plex reactions using an Applied Biosystems 7300 Real Time PCR System, Applied Biosystems Universal PCR Master Mix, RNase-free water, and primer-probe sets from Applied Biosystems. Primer-probe sets were used for each gene that can bind identical sequences of DNA for all three species (Table 2). The final primer/probe concentrations were 0.9 and 0.25 μ M, respectively and determined by Applied Biosystems optimized for use with their Custom TaqMan Gene Expression Assay Service and Universal PCR Master Mix. The amplified region of each

Table 1	B
Drimer	compances

Gene and direction Primer name and sequence TRα forward DRB182 5' CCAGACAGCGAGACCCTAAC DRB206 5' CCRCAVTCNACCTTCATPTC ^a	
TRα forward DRB182 5' CCAGACAGCGAGACCCTAAC	
TRβ forwardDRB203 5' TGYAARTAYGARGGNAARTGYGTTRβ reverseDRB185 5' TAGGAGCCTGCCCAATATCTTCrpL8 forwardDRB20b 5' CGTGGTGCTCCTCTTGCCAAGrpL8 reverseDRB21b 5' GACGACCAGTACGACGAGCAG	
rpL8 forward DRB207 5' ATGGCTACATCAAGGGNATTGTGA rpL8 reverse DRB208 5' TTGCGACCAGCTGGRGCATC	AAG

^a Also binds TR β .

Taqman primer/probe set crossed an intron/exon boundary (based on the *X. tropicalis* genome sequence) to mitigate amplification of contaminating genomic DNA in the qPCR reactions. Serial dilutions of *S. couchii* stage 42 (climax of metamorphosis) whole body cDNA were used as standards (*P. cultripes* stage 42 whole body cDNA standards gave parallel results), where slopes ranged from -3.42to -3.87 (a slope of -3.54 reflects 100% amplification efficiency) and R² values averaged 0.998 (range (0.996–0.999). In every reaction, no template controls were used and failed to detect any reaction product contamination. All samples were run in duplicate. qPCR conditions were as follows: 50 °C 2 min, 95 °C 10 min, then 40 cycles of 95 °C 10 s, 60 °C 1 min.

2.6. Tail muscle injections

The control expression plasmid for tail injection pDPHGHG-HS4 was based on vectors previously published Ref. [33] and engineered using gene synthesis (DNA20.com) and standard cloning methods. To make the TR α expression plasmid pDPHGHTRa-HS4, X. laevis TRa was cloned into the AgeI/EcoRI sites of pDPHGHG-HS4 replacing one of the GFPs. Before injection, NF stage 55-57 tadpoles were given a 5 min. heat shock at 33 °C. The next day, tadpoles were anesthetized in benzocaine and injected into the tail muscle with 0.5 μL of 2 $\mu g/\mu L$ plasmid DNA, control plasmid on the left side of the tadpole and $TR\alpha$ plasmid on the right, based on previous methods [10,36]. In brief, needles were loaded with DNA in water containing 0.05% w/v fast green dye (Sigma) to visualize site of injection (the dye dissipated within hours) and held in place with a Drummond micromanipulator in the forth and sixth myomeres from the hind limb insertion point to a depth of 300-500 µm. Injection was carried out with a Picospritzer III (Parker Instruments) under 40 lbs of pressure with a 200-400 ms pulse. Beginning the same day as injection (Day 0), expression of the exogenous genes was induced by daily 1 h heat shocks at 33-34 °C [15]. On Day 3, daily treatment of 0 or 2 nM T3 was begun. On Days 3-17, tails were imaged under a fluorescence dissecting microscope, and the number of GFP-positive cells was counted. Within each T3 and plasmid injection treatment, 3-5 tadpoles were injected for a total of 20-50 GFP-positive cells.

Table 1A

Primers, PCR settings, and product sizes for amplifying TRα, TRβ, and rpL8 from S. couchii, S. multiplicata, P. cultripes, and GenBank accession numbers.

Gene	Species	Primers	PCR settings	Product size	Accession numbers
TRα	S. couchii	DRB182/206	94C 30s-52C 30s-68C 40s	374 bp	HQ682068
TRα	S. multiplicata	DRB182/206	94C 30s-45C 30s-65C 40s	374 bp	HQ682069
TRα	P. cultripes	DRB182/206	94C 30s-50C 30s-68C 40s	374 bp	HQ682070
TRβ	S. couchii	DRB203/185	94C 30s-45C 30s-65C 40s	305 bp	HQ682073
TRβ	S. multiplicata	DRB203/185	94C 30s-45C 30s-65C 40s	305 bp	HQ682072
TRβ	P. cultripes	DRB203/185	94C 30s-50C 30s-68C 40s	305 bp	HQ682071
rpL8	S. couchii	DRB20b/21b	94C 30s-52C 30s-68C 40s	576 bp	HQ682076
rpL8	S. multiplicata	DRB207/208	94C 30s-45C 30s-65C 40s	589 bp	HQ682074
rpL8	P. cultripes	DRB20b/21b	94C 30s-52C 30s-68C 40s	576 bp	HQ682075

A.R. Hollar et al. / General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

Table 2

Primer and probe sequences used for single-plex quantitative PCR with expected product size in base pairs (bp).

Gene	Forward primer	Reverse primer	FAM-labeled probe	Product
TRα	TCCTCAGACCGTACGGGTTT	CAGGCCCCAATCATGCG	TCGCAAACACAACATTC	165 bp
TRβ	GGAACCAGTGCCAAGAATG	TCATCCAAGACCAAGTCTGTTG	CGCTTCAAAAAGTG	123 bp
rpL8	CACAATCCTGAAACCAAGAAAACCA	CCACACCACGGACACGT	AAGGCCAAGAGAAACT	193 bp

2.7. Statistical analyses

Statistical analyses were done using JMP 7.0 statistical software. Normality of all data was tested using a Fit Distribution and Fitted Normal test. Data that were not normal were log-transformed and then re-tested. Homogeneity of variances of all data was tested using an UnEqual Variances *F* test. In the presence of significant heterogeneity, values were log-transformed and re-tested. Within each stage or time point, the averaged technical duplicates for each gene were analyzed by ANOVA followed by a Tukey–Kramer post hoc test for significant differences among species at $\alpha = 0.05$. In addition, differences within species across stages or time points were similarly analyzed. Data that were not normal or had significant heterogeneity of variances that persisted after log transformation were analyzed pairwise using the nonparametric Wilcoxon tests.

3. Results

To compare TR expression across spadefoot species, portions of TR α , TR β , and rpL8 from three to four individuals per gene per species were PCR amplified and sequenced (Supplementary Fig. 1). We sequenced 316–334 bases (depending on species) of the TR α ligand binding domain, 286 bases of the TR^β DNA binding domain, and 505-542 bases of the housekeeping gene rpL8. The nucleotide and protein identities were $\ge 85\%$ for TR α , $\ge 90\%$ for TR β , and ≥85% for rpL8 among spadefoot species. Taqman primer/probe sets for quantitative PCR were designed to bind regions of nucleotide sequence identity for each gene across all three spadefoot species (Supplementary Fig. 1). Very few sequence polymorphisms were identified (Supplementary Fig. 1), and none were found in the primer/probe regions. In addition, the amplified region of each Tagman primer/probe set crossed an intron/exon boundary (based on the X. tropicalis genome sequence) to mitigate amplification of contaminating genomic DNA in the qPCR reactions.

To compare TR across species during early development, we measured whole-body TR α and TR β mRNA expression during premetamorphic development (Gosner stages 23–28). Because rpL8 values were significantly decreased at Gosner stage 28 for *P. cultripes* and *S. multiplicata*, we compared species from Gosner stages 23–27. All species had detectable TR α and TR β starting at the earliest stage, Gosner 23 (Fig. 1). Also, all species significantly increased TR α levels to a similar degree (1.7- to 2.2-fold change from stage 23–27), though *S. multiplicata* was the only species to significantly increase its TR β expression (2-fold change) from stage 23–27. *S. multiplicata* and *S. couchii* had significantly more TR α mRNA expression (3- to 4-fold more) than *P. cultripes* at each stage (Fig. 1A). For TR β , *P. cultripes* had 50% more expression than the other species, though the overall levels of TR β at this stage were very low (Fig. 1B).

To compare TR expression across species during natural metamorphosis, we measured TR α and TR β mRNA expression from tails at Gosner stages 32, 35, 38, 42, and 44. The rpL8 values were significantly higher within *S. couchii* at stage 32 compared to the other stages and significantly lower at stage 44 for *P. cultripes* and *S. multiplicata*. Thus, we compared species at stages 35 (beginning of metamorphosis, TH levels begin to rise), 38 (TH levels are at their midpoint), and 42 (climax of metamorphosis and TH levels). We used tail tissue instead of whole body samples because previous work demonstrating variance in responsivity between the three species was done using tail tissue [5]. The <2-fold changes in TR α levels from stage 35–42 were not significant in any of the three species, but *S. couchii* had significantly more TR α compared to *P. cultripes* across these stages (Fig. 2A). In contrast, all species significantly increased TR β expression and had comparable TR β levels (Fig. 2B).

To compare TH signaling through the TRs at the molecular level across species, we administered exogenous T3 to premetamorphic tadpoles of all three species beginning at Gosner stage 31, well before endogenous TH levels become detectable in the body. We used two T3 doses, 8 nM T3 was the minimum to induce a response in tail tissue across spadefoot toad genera [5] and 50 nM T3 was used as a potentially saturating dose. For all species, $TR\alpha$ and $TR\beta$ expression levels significantly changed in response to both doses of T3 (Figs. 3 and 4). As during natural metamorphosis, there were no significant differences in TH-induced TR α or TR β expression between S. multiplicata and P. cultripes, regardless of T3 dose or receptor isoform. Similarly, all three species had similar fold changes in TRa across time points (2- to 3-fold change), but S. couchii had a greater level TRa mRNA expression (3- to 4-fold more) compared to the other species (Figs. 3A and 4A). Unlike in natural metamorphosis, TR^β levels were greater in S. couchii (up to 2- to 3-fold more) compared to S. multiplicata and P. cultripes by 12 h for both T3 treatments (Figs. 3A and 4A). Significant differences were maintained throughout the treatments for TR α . In addition, the typical decline in TR^β expression occurred earlier and more dramatically in S. couchii compared to the other species at the 8 nM dose (Fig. 4B). The rpL8 values did not significantly change in P. cultripes or S. multiplicata but significantly and gradually decreased in S. couchii across the time points (Figs. 3C and 4C).

To directly evaluate the possible effect of increased TR expression on the rate of metamorphic change, we overexpressed TR α in tail muscle cells in *X. laevis* and compared their rate of disappearance relative to control muscle cells. Digital images of tails injected with control and TR α plasmids (Fig. 5A) and treated with or without 2 nM T3 were taken daily for 2 weeks so that the disappearance of individual cells could be recorded (Fig. 5B). In the absence of T3, cells did not disappear after use of either the control or TR α expression plasmids. However, in the presence of 2 nM T3, cells with TR α overexpression disappeared about twice as quickly compared to controls (Fig. 5C).

4. Discussion

To examine the role of TR underlying the evolution of accelerated metamorphosis in desert spadefoot toads, we compared the levels of TR α and TR β mRNA expression during early premetamorphic development in whole bodies. According to the dual function model [7], the role of TR in premetamorphosis prior to circulating TH is to repress genes important for metamorphosis [37]. Therefore, we hypothesized that early TR expression to achieve a shorter larval period should be delayed in *S. couchii*, which has the fastest metamorphosis, because metamorphic genes would have higher levels of expression in the absence of TR repression. However,

Author's personal copy

A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

Early Development

Metamorphosis



Fig. 1. Quantitation of TR α and TR β mRNA expression during early development in spadefoot toads. cDNA was prepared from RNA isolated from whole bodies of *P. cultripes, S. multiplicata* and *S. couchii* tadpoles at stages 23–27 and then analyzed by qPCR using (A) TR α , (B) TR β , and (C) rpL8 primer/probe sets. Data points indicate means and SE, *n* = 4–5. Circles around data points indicate significance groups determined by Tukey–Kramer post hoc tests across species within a stage. Lack of circles indicates lack of significant differences. Letters in the tables represent significance groups across stages within a species. Numbers in the tables indicate her greatest fold changes in gene expression within a species relative to stage 23 for each gene. n.a. = not applicable, because *S. couchii* lacks stage 25 [3].

mRNA for both TR isoforms was detectable in each species at all of the early stages that we sampled (Gosner 23–28), failing to support our hypothesis. Furthermore, the sum of TR expression levels are



Fig. 2. Quantitation of TR α and TR β expression during natural metamorphosis in spadefoot toads. cDNA was prepared from RNA isolated from tails of *P. cultripes, S. multiplicata*, and *S. couchii* tadpoles at stages 35, 38, and 42 and analyzed by qPCR using (A) TR α , (B) TR β , and (C) rpL8 primer/probe sets. Data points indicate means and SE, *n* = 4–7. Circles around data points indicate significance groups determined by Tukey–Kramer post hoc tests across species within a stage. Lack of circles indicates lack of significant differences. Letters in the tables indicate the greatest fold changes in gene expression within a species relative to stage 35 for each gene.

likely higher during premetamorphosis in *S. couchii* because TR α mRNA levels were about 3-fold higher and TR β mRNA levels were only 30% lower compared to *P. cultripes* (Fig. 1A and B).

During metamorphosis in the presence of TH, the dual function model says the role of TR is to induce genes important to initiate metamorphosis. Also, because the rate of metamorphosis is

Author's personal copy

A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198



Time (hrs) of T3 treatment

Fig. 3. Quantitation of TR α and TR β expression during 50 nM T3-induced metamorphosis in spadefoot toads. Gosner stage 31 *P. cultripes, S. multiplicata,* and *S. couchii* tadpoles were reared in water with 50 nM T3 for 0–72 h. cDNA was prepared from RNA isolated from tails harvested at the indicated time points and analyzed by qPCR using (A) TR α , (B) TR β , and (C) rpL8 primer/probe sets. Data points indicate means and SE, *n* = 3–6. Circles around data points indicate significance groups determined by Tukey–Kramer post hoc tests across species within a time point. Lack of circles indicates lack of significant differences. Letters in the tables represent significance groups across time points within a species. Numbers in the tables indicate the greatest fold changes in gene expression within a species relative to time 0 for each gene.

positively correlated with TH concentration added exogenously [12], more signaling through TR likely increases the metamorphic





	0	12	24	48	72	120	168	fold
Sc	а	cd	е	de	bc	died	died	11.4
Sm	а	b	bc	bc	bc	с	died	6.4
Pc	а	ab	bc	bc	bc	с	С	6.9



Time (hrs) of T3 treatment

Fig. 4. Quantification of TR α and TR β expression during 8 nM T3-induced metamorphosis in spadefoot toads. Gosner stage 31 *P. cultripes, S. multiplicata*, and *S. couchii* tadpoles were reared in water with 8 nM T3 for 0–168 h. cDNA was prepared from RNA isolated from tails harvested at the indicated time points and analyzed by qPCR using (A) TR α , (B) TR β , and (C) rpL8 primer/probe sets. Data points indicate means and SE, *n* = 3–6. Circles around data points indicate significance groups determined by Tukey–Kramer post hoc tests across species within a time point. Lack of circles indicates lack of significant differences. Letters in the tables represent significance groups across time points within a species. Numbers in the tables indicate the greatest fold changes in gene expression within a species relative to time 0 for each gene.

rate. Thus, we measured TR α and TR β mRNA expression in tails to test the hypothesis that during natural metamorphosis, *S. couchii* has more TR α and/or TR β enabling greater TH/TR signaling leading to its faster rate of metamorphosis. *S. couchii* had significantly higher TR α expression levels compared to the other species, consistent with our hypothesis. Surprisingly, TR β expression profiles were similar during metamorphosis across species. The higher A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198



Fig. 5. Overexpression of TR α increases the rate of T3-induced metamorphic change. (A) Diagram of control and TR α expression constructs. Heat shock promoters (HSPs) regulate expression of two GFP (green fluorescent protein) genes in the control expression plasmid, and HSPs regulate expression of one GFP and one TR α in the TR α expression plasmid. (B) Exemplar images of GFP expressing muscle cells. Tadpoles were injected with control and TR α expression plasmids in the left and right side of the tail muscle respectively and heat shocked, T3-treated, and photographed daily. The number of visible GFP expressing cells due to heat shock increased until Day 5. On Day 8, all cells remained visible, except in T3-treated tadpoles injected with the TR α expression plasmid. White arrows indicate examples of muscle cell disappearance. GFP expressing cells were monitored daily for two weeks, and the number of visible cells stopped increasing on Day 5 for all treatments and thus cell disappearance was quantified relative the peak number on Day 5, n = 20-50. In the absence of T3, GFP expressing cells disappeared nearly twice as fast in muscle cells overexpressing TR α compared to controls.

levels of TR α may enable the TR β levels in *S. couchii* to be achieved in a fraction of the time compared to the other species. Autoinduction of TR seems to be a critical component of metamorphosis [44], as the level of TR is not sufficient to bind thyroid hormone response elements in all TH-response genes at pre-induction TR levels [8]. Thus, a species that has a head start, i.e., higher premetamorphic TR levels, may require less time to achieve sufficient levels of TR required for the full TH gene regulation cascade.

We measured TR mRNA as a proxy for comparing the more biologically relevant protein activity levels across species. However, appropriate comparison of mRNA levels across species requires careful consideration. As in other studies [13,42], we found that rpL8 values were not constant across stages or treatments. Thus, we did not normalize TR to the housekeeping gene rpL8 and restricted our analyses to where rpL8 values were not different among stages for the three species (Figs. 1 and 2), though this was not possible for species comparisons across T3 treatments (Figs. 3 and 4). Furthermore, rpL8 levels varied significantly across species, precluding its use in normalization even during stages when its levels did not vary within species. Our results are therefore reported as TR α mRNA levels relative to total RNA, because cDNA from all three species was prepared using 2 µg of RNA and the same volume of cDNA was used in each qPCR reaction.

For various reasons, this metric (TR mRNA per unit total RNA) used in isolation does not guarantee a comparable level of TR protein activity per cell. Potential differential processing of mRNA into protein, post-translational modifications, and/or protein turn over across stages or treatments within a species or across species, reduces the reliability of mRNA as a proxy for protein activity comparisons across species. Even if we compared protein levels across species, genome size differences may negatively influence the appropriateness of such comparisons. The genome size differs by three fold among species (P. cultripes has four picograms DNA per haploid genome, and S. multiplicata and S. couchii have 1.3 ("Animal Genome Size Database" http://www.genomesize.com/)). Genomes that are larger in size are also likely to have more noncoding DNA, and the amount of TRE binding sites in these different genomes is unknown. Because TRs bind to TREs to induce gene expression, divergent amounts of TREs in non-coding regions of genomes could alter effective levels of TRs, such that bigger genomes may require more TR per cell to achieve the same level of gene expression compared to cells with fewer non-productive TR binding sites. Thus, it is possible that neither mRNA nor protein expression level comparisons across species would guarantee relevant differences in TR activity across species.

Because of these difficulties, we used a second approach to deduce whether TR protein activity may differ among species, namely a TH-response gene induction assay where different TR protein activity levels may underlie altered TH-response gene expression kinetics. In Xenopus upon administering T3, TR_β expression is induced, reaches a peak, and then declines [38]. We hypothesized that the expression profile of TR β in S. couchii would be compressed in time, consistent with its higher TRa mRNA expression levels compared to the other spadefoot species, i.e., TR^β expression would go up and back down faster. At the higher 50 nM T3 dose, we found that the expression profiles for $TR\beta$ were similar across species in that TR β expression was significantly up regulated by 12 h, peaked and 24 h, and began to decline by 48 h. On the other hand, the lower dose of 8 nM T3-induced an earlier significant increase in TRβ in S. couchii and S. multiplicata compared to P. cultripes, 12 h vs. 24 h. Also, the peak TRβ value was achieved by 24 h in S. couchii and 120 h in the other species, and TR^β levels started to decrease only in S. couchii over the T3 treatment period. In addition, S. multiplicata and P. cultripes significantly differ in larval period duration but do not have significant differences in TR expression or TR β induction characteristics. However, though not significant, the TR values for S. multiplicata were generally intermediate between S. couchii and P. cultripes, corresponding to larval period differences [4].

The species differences we observed in gene induction after TH exposure are consistent with species differences in TR protein activity, but other factors may also be involved. For the induction assay, we used T3, rather than T4, ruling out any contributions to TH/TR signaling from deiodinase type 2 (converts T4 to T3). However, species differences in expression of cytoplasmic TH-binding proteins, deiodinase type 3 (degrades T3), TH-transporters, and TR-associated transcription factors, as well as TRs, may contribute to species differences in TH signaling/gene induction activity [2]. Although our study cannot discriminate among the potential contributions of these factors, these data indicate that one or more of these factors have been altered in S. couchii to explain the increase in TH-response gene expression. In combination with TR α mRNA differences, the TH-response gene induction comparisons point to a contributing role for TR α in larval period differences among species.

When comparing results from natural and induced metamorphosis, the TR β expression profiles were similar across species during natural metamorphosis, whereas after T3 induction the TR β profile of *S. couchii* achieved higher levels compared to the other species. In addition, the fold change in TR β expression levels was higher after T3 induction than during natural metamorphosis for all three species. In contrast, the differences in TR α profiles among species were maintained in natural and induced metamorphoses, i.e., TR α levels in *S. couchii* were higher at all time points compared

to the other species. However, as with TR β , the fold change was greater after T3 treatment compared to natural metamorphosis for all three species. The higher fold changes in induced metamorphosis may reflect supraphysiologic amounts of T3, which may induce to higher levels TR α (a TH indirect response gene) and TR β (a TH direct response gene). The greater TR β induction in induced metamorphosis only in *S. couchii* may be due to different premetamorphic levels of corticosterone among species. Corticosterone peaks at metamorphosis and synergizes with TH to increase the expression levels of many TH-response genes [16,23,24]. *S. couchii* may have more corticosterone to synergize with exogenous T3 at stage 31 when the T3 treatments were carried out compared to the other species (Kulkarni and Buchholz, unpublished).

Our TR expression and T3-induction results indicated a correlation between higher TR α expression and shorter larval periods among spadefoot toads. To directly test the effects of TR expression levels on rates of metamorphic change, we measured the rate of T3-inudced disappearance of tail muscle cells with and without overexpressed TR α in *X. laevis.* In the absence of T3, muscle cells did not disappear, even with TR α overexpression. However, muscle cells died after T3 treatment as during natural metamorphosis, but the rate of disappearance was greater in muscle cells overexpressing TR α . Thus, species differences in TR α expression levels may contribute different rates of metamorphosis among species.

5. Conclusions

We show that TR α , and not TR β , mRNA expression levels are higher in the desert spadefoot species *S. couchii* compared to its relatives that have longer larval periods. *S. couchii* also has faster THresponse gene induction kinetics that, in combination with its higher TR α mRNA levels, suggests this species has greater TR protein activity during metamorphosis. The effect of increased TR activity on metamorphic rate was examined in the model frog *X. laevis*, where we showed that the rate of T3-induced metamorphic change was higher when TR α was overexpressed in tail muscle cells. The higher expression of TR α in the absence of TH in *S. couchii* is expected to increase tissue sensitivity and responsivity to TH once it is released in circulation enabling faster gene induction kinetics underlying the more rapid rate of tissue transformation during metamorphosis.

Acknowledgments

We thank Dr. B. Storz for collecting *S. multiplicata* and *S. couchii* and Dr. I. Gomez-Mestre for collecting *P. cultripes*. This work was done in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Master's degree for ARH. Support for this research was provided by NSF IOS 0950538 to DRB.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.ygcen.2011.05.013.

References

- D.D. Brown, The role of deiodinases in amphibian metamorphosis, Thyroid 15 (8) (2005) 815–821.
- [2] D.R. Buchholz, C. Moskalik, S. Kulkarni, A. Hollar, A. Ng, Hormone regulation and the evolution of frog metamorphic diversity (Chapter 7), in: T. Flatt, A. Heyland (Eds.), Mechanisms of Life History Evolution, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011.
- [3] D.R. Buchholz, A.R. Hollar, C. Ledon-Retig, S. couchii: developmental morphology, Herpetol. Rev. 41 (2010), in press.
- [4] D.R. Buchholz, T.B. Hayes, Evolutionary patterns of diversity in spadefoot toad metamorphosis (Anura:Pelobatidae), Copeia 2002 (2002) 180–189.

Author's personal copy

198

A.R. Hollar et al./General and Comparative Endocrinology 173 (2011) 190-198

- [5] D.R. Buchholz, T.B. Hayes, Variation in thyroid hormone action and tissue content underlies species differences in the timing of metamorphosis in desert frogs, Evol. Dev. 7 (5) (2005) 458–467.
- [6] D.R. Buchholz, S.C. Hsia, L. Fu, Y.B. Shi, A dominant-negative thyroid hormone receptor blocks amphibian metamorphosis by retaining corepressors at target genes, Mol. Cell. Biol. 23 (19) (2003) 6750–6758.
- [7] D.R. Buchholz, B.D. Paul, L. Fu, Y.B. Shi, Molecular and developmental analyses of thyroid hormone receptor function in *X. laevis*, the African clawed frog, Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 145 (1) (2006) 1–19.
- [8] D.R. Buchholz, B.D. Paul, Y.B. Shi, Gene-specific changes in promoter occupancy by thyroid hormone receptor during frog metamorphosis. Implications for developmental gene regulation, J. Biol. Chem. 280 (50) (2005) 41222–41228.
- [9] B. Das, H. Matsuda, K. Fujimoto, G. Sun, K. Matsuura, Y.B. Shi, Molecular and genetic studies suggest that thyroid hormone receptor is both necessary and sufficient to mediate the developmental effects of thyroid hormone, Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 168 (2) (2010) 174–180.
- [10] A. de Luze, L. Sachs, B. Demeneix, Thyroid hormone-dependent transcriptional regulation of exogenous genes transferred into *X. tadpole* muscle *in vivo*, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U S A 90 (15) (1993) 7322–7326.
- [11] R.J. Denver, F. Hu, T.S. Scanlan, J.D. Furlow, Thyroid hormone receptor subtype specificity for hormone-dependent neurogenesis in *X. laevis*, Dev. Biol. 326 (1) (2009) 155–168.
- [12] M.H.I. Dodd, J.M. Dodd, The biology of metamorphosis, in: B. Lofts (Ed.), Physiology of the Amphibia, Academic Press, Inc., New York, 1976, pp. 467– 599.
- [13] P. Duarte-Guterman, V.S. Langlois, B.D. Pauli, V.L. Trudeau, Expression and T3 regulation of thyroid hormone- and sex steroid-related genes during Silurana (*Xenopus*) tropicalis early development, Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 166 (2) (2010) 428–435.
- [14] W.E. Duellman, L. Trueb, Biology of Amphibians, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1994.
- [15] L. Fu, D. Buchholz, Y.B. Shi, Novel double promoter approach for identification of transgenic animals: a tool for *in vivo* analysis of gene function and development of gene-based therapies, Mol. Reprod. Dev. 62 (4) (2002) 470– 476.
- [16] V.A. Galton, Mechanisms underlying the acceleration of thyroid hormoneinduced tadpole metamorphosis by corticosterone, Endocrinology 127 (6) (1990) 2997–3002.
- [17] M. Garcia-Paris, D.R. Buchholz, G. Parra-Olea, Phylogenetic relationships of Pelobatoidea re-examined using mtDNA, Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 28 (1) (2003) 12–23.
- [18] B. Gereben, A.M. Zavacki, S. Ribich, B.W. Kim, S.A. Huang, W.S. Simonides, A. Zeold, A.C. Bianco, Cellular and molecular basis of deiodinase-regulated thyroid hormone signaling, Endocr. Rev. 29 (7) (2008) 898–938.
- [19] K.L. Gosner, A simplified table for staging anuran embryos and larvae with notes on identification, Herpetologica 161 (1960) 183–190.
 [20] E. Havis, S. Le Mevel, G. Morvan Dubois, D.L. Shi, T.S. Scanlan, B.A. Demeneix,
- [20] E. Havis, S. Le Mevel, G. Morvan Dubois, D.L. Shi, T.S. Scanlan, B.A. Demeneix, L.M. Sachs, Unliganded thyroid hormone receptor is essential for *X. laevis* eye development, EMBO J. 25 (20) (2006) 4943–4951.
- [21] E. Havis, L.M. Sachs, B.A. Demeneix, Metamorphic T3-response genes have specific co-regulator requirements, EMBO Rep. 4 (9) (2003) 883–888.
- [22] G. Hennemann, R. Docter, E.C. Friesema, M. de Jong, E.P. Krenning, T.J. Visser, Plasma membrane transport of thyroid hormones and its role in thyroid hormone metabolism and bioavailability, Endocr. Rev. 22 (4) (2001) 451–476.
 [23] S. Kikuyama, K. Kawamura, S. Tanaka, K. Yamamoto, Aspects of amphibian
- metamorphosis: hormonal control, Int. Rev. Cytol. 145 (1993) 105–148.
- [24] L.P. Krain, R.J. Denver, Developmental expression and hormonal regulation of glucocorticoid and thyroid hormone receptors during metamorphosis in *X. laevis*, J. Endocrinol. 181 (1) (2004) 91–104.
- [25] S.L. Kuzmin, The Amphibians of the Former Soviet Union, Pensoft, Sofiya, Bulgaria, 1999.
- [26] H. Matsuda, B.D. Paul, C.Y. Choi, T. Hasebe, Y.B. Shi, Novel functions of protein arginine methyltransferase 1 in thyroid hormone receptor-mediated

transcription and in the regulation of metamorphic rate in *X. laevis*, Mol. Cell. Biol. 29 (3) (2009) 745–757.

- [27] R.W. McDiarmid, R. Áltig (Eds.), Tadpoles: The Biology of Nnuran Larvae, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1999. p. 444.
- [28] R.A. Newman, Adaptive plasticity in amphibian metamorphosis, BioScience 42 (1992) 671–678.
- [29] P.D. Nieuwkoop, J. Faber, Normal Table of X. laevis (Daudin), Garland Publishing, New York, 1994.
- [30] B.D. Paul, D.R. Buchholz, L. Fu, Y.B. Shi, Tissue- and gene-specific recruitment of steroid receptor coactivator-3 by thyroid hormone receptor during development, J. Biol. Chem. 280 (29) (2005) 27165–27172.
- [31] B.D. Paul, D.R. Buchholz, L. Fu, Y.B. Shi, SRC-p300 coactivator complex is required for thyroid hormone-induced amphibian metamorphosis, J. Biol. Chem. 282 (10) (2007) 7472–7481.
 [32] B.D. Paul, L. Fu, D.R. Buchholz, Y.B. Shi, Coactivator recruitment is essential for
- [32] B.D. Paul, L. Fu, D.R. Buchholz, Y.B. Shi, Coactivator recruitment is essential for liganded thyroid hormone receptor to initiate amphibian metamorphosis, Mol. Cell. Biol. 25 (13) (2005) 5712–5724.
- [33] S.A. Rankin, T. Hasebe, A.M. Zorn, D.R. Buchholz, Improved Cre reporter transgenic Xenopus, Dev. Dynamics 238 (2009) 2401–2408.
- [34] M. Ranjan, J. Wong, Y.B. Shi, Transcriptional repression of *Xenopus* TR beta gene is mediated by a thyroid hormone response element located near the start site, J. Biol. Chem. 269 (40) (1994) 24699–24705.
- [35] L.M. Sachs, P.L. Jones, E. Havis, N. Rouse, B.A. Demeneix, Y.B. Shi, Nuclear receptor corepressor recruitment by unliganded thyroid hormone receptor in gene repression during *X. laevis* development, Mol. Cell. Biol. 22 (24) (2002) 8527–8538.
- [36] L.M. Sachs, S. Le Mevel, B.A. Demeneix, Implication of bax in *X. laevis* tail regression at metamorphosis, Dev. Dyn. 231 (4) (2004) 671–682.
- [37] Y. Sato, D.R. Buchholz, B.D. Paul, Y.B. Shi, A role of unliganded thyroid hormone receptor in postembryonic development in X. *laevis*, Mech. Dev. 124 (6) (2007) 476–488.
- [38] Y. Shi, Amphibian Metamorphosis: from Morphology to Molecular Biology, Wiley Liss Inc., New York, 1999.
- [39] Y.B. Shi, V.C. Liang, C. Parkison, S.Y. Cheng, Tissue-dependent developmental expression of a cytosolic thyroid hormone protein gene in *Xenopus*: its role in the regulation of amphibian metamorphosis, FEBS Lett. 355 (1) (1994) 61–64.
- [40] Y.B. Shi, J.W. Ritchie, P.M. Taylor, Complex regulation of thyroid hormone action: multiple opportunities for pharmacological intervention, Pharmacol. Ther. 94 (3) (2002) 235–251.
- [41] Y.B. Shi, J. Wong, M. Puzianowska-Kuznicka, M.A. Stolow, Tadpole competence and tissue-specific temporal regulation of amphibian metamorphosis: roles of thyroid hormone and its receptors, Bioessays 18 (5) (1996) 391–399.
- [42] R. Sindelka, Z. Ferjentsik, J. Jonak, Developmental expression profiles of X. laevis reference genes, Dev. Dyn. 235 (3) (2006) 754–758.
- [43] R.C. Stebbins, Amphibians of western North America, University of California Press, Berkeley, 1951.
- [44] J.R. Tata, B.S. Baker, I. Machuca, E.M. Rabelo, K. Yamauchi, Autoinduction of nuclear receptor genes and its significance, J. Steroid Biochem. Mol. Biol. 46 (2) (1993) 105–119.
- [45] A. Tomita, D.R. Buchholz, Y.B. Shi, Recruitment of N-CoR/SMRT-TBLR1 corepressor complex by unliganded thyroid hormone receptor for gene repression during frog development, Mol. Cell. Biol. 24 (8) (2004) 3337–3346.
 [46] W.E. Visser, E.C. Friesema, T.J. Visser, Minireview: thyroid hormone
- [46] W.E. Visser, E.C. Friesema, T.J. Visser, Minireview: thyroid hormone transporters: the knowns and the unknowns, Mol. Endocrinol. (2010).
- [47] X. Wang, H. Matsuda, Y.B. Shi, Developmental regulation and function of thyroid hormone receptors and 9-cis retinoic acid receptors during *X. tropicalis* metamorphosis, Endocrinology 149 (11) (2008) 5610–5618.
- [48] Y. Yaoita, D.D. Brown, A correlation of thyroid hormone receptor gene expression with amphibian metamorphosis, Genes Dev. 4 (11) (1990) 1917– 1924.
- [49] Y. Yaoita, Y. Shi, D. Brown, X. laevis alpha and beta thyroid hormone receptors, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U S A 87 (21) (1990) 8684.